Negative: MAVNI

By Jonathan T. Helton

Summary: This NEG argues that the AFF plan to bring back MAVNI is unnecessary. We aren’t deporting any veterans, and Congress is already taking steps to address the lack of soldiers in the army. Bringing MAVNI back also discriminates against both American citizens and legal immigrants; it’s just a fast-track to citizenship, bypassing the normal vetting procedures. Of course, the main justification for ending the program was to prevent infiltration. Terrorists would like to gain the skills we teach in the military, so they have an incentive to get in. The other issue with MAVNI is that it was used incorrectly. The skilled people we let into the military weren’t always serving in skilled areas.

NEGATIVE BRIEF: MAVNI 3

NEGATIVE PHILOSOPHY 3

MAVNI undermines fairness and jeopardizes security 3

HARMS / SIGNIFICANCE 3

1. Policy discrimination ended. 3

We have simply made the new process the same as the process all others have to go through. 3

2. No deportations. 3

DACA recipients are cleared to stay 3

Outliers that were still in limbo have been cleared 4

3. Technology solves for language barriers 4

Army has software translation tools for use in the field to solve communication issues 4

4. Manpower: National Guard and Reserves are available 4

826K active reserves and 275K inactive reserves 4

5. No racism 5

It was that terrible racist Obama in 2016 who first put the brakes on MAVNI, 2 months before Trump was elected 5

MAVNI Shutdown: Security concerns, not racism. And Obama (2016), not Trump. 5

INHERENCY 5

1. Recruitment / Manpower being improved in Status Quo 5

Link: Pay gap. A reason the military is increasingly unattractive to people is because it doesn’t pay well. 5

Impact: NDAA solves for the pay gap 6

SOLVENCY 6

1. MAVNI mismanagement 6

MAVNI was mismanaged and some recruits had links to foreign espionage 6

Representative Steve Russell: MAVNI was suspended for good reason – too many problems 6

2. No MAVNI skills benefit 7

MAVNI recruits aren’t high-skill: They’re cooks and other low-skill occupations 7

3. Fingerprint laws 7

USCIS changed other rules that also reduce the military path to immigrate. 7

Processing MAVNI applicants; Fingerprint laws remain 7

DISADVANTAGES 8

1. Infiltration & Terrorism 8

Link: Look before you leap; subject people to screening *before* letting them into the military 8

Link: MAVNI recruits can bypass security checks and get enlisted despite DoD safeguards 8

Link: Military amnesty threatens national security because absence of valid documentation opens a dangerous loophole 8

Link: Military bases are a prime target for terrorists, and joining the military is a known avenue for bad guys 8

Link: Military training would aid terrorists 9

Link: MAVNI recruits use fake documents and are sent by foreign intelligence agencies, or even profess allegiance to America’s enemies 9

Impact: Terrorism. Example: Kabir, Afghan US Air Force enlistee who helped Al Qaeda 9

Impact: Destruction of productive resources 9

2. Military manpower 10

Turn AFF’s manpower harms – plan uses up manpower on more paperwork 10

3. Discrimination against legal immigrants 10

4. Encourages illegal immigration 10

Link: MAVNI promotes illegal immigration 10

Backup: Waste, fraud, and abuse always accompany any system of adjusting illegal aliens and encourages more illegal immigration 11

Link: Rewarding bad behavior produces more of it 11

Impact: Crime 11

Impact: Kills jobs 12

Works Cited: MAVNI (NEG) 13

NEGATIVE BRIEF: MAVNI

NEGATIVE PHILOSOPHY

MAVNI undermines fairness and jeopardizes security

Dan Cadman 2017 (retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience; served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad.) 4 August 2017 “MAVNI: Inappropriate Access to the Military and Needless Security Risk” <https://cis.org/Cadman/MAVNI-Inappropriate-Access-Military-and-Needless-Security-Risk>

One of our board members, retired[Lt. Gen. Harry E. Soyster](https://cis.org/Soyster), who at one time ran the Defense Intelligence Agency, has been particularly [plain-spoken](https://cis.org/Cadman/National-Defense-Authorization-Act-Drawn-Immigration-Battleground) about this: "The standards to enter today's military are rigorous and should not be subject to compromise. With the many threats posed around the world that our armed forces are obliged to meet to keep Americans safe, enlistment programs are not the place to try to enact social policies or achieve political goals. It also is not fair to our serving soldiers and veterans who have met the standards and exceeded our expectations in repeated deployments in defense of their country."

HARMS / SIGNIFICANCE

1. Policy discrimination ended.

We have simply made the new process the same as the process all others have to go through.

Press Release by the Department of Defense 2017 (Written by Jim Garamone) 13 October 2017 “DoD Announces Policies Affecting Foreign Nationals Entering Military” [Brackets added] <https://www.defense.gov/News/Article/Article/1342430/dod-announces-policies-affecting-foreign-nationals-entering-military/>

Service members receive a characterization of service after serving 180 days. "In order for foreign nationals to achieve expedited citizenship on the basis of their military service, they must receive an honorable service recommendation," [Stephanie Miller, DoD's director of accessions] Miller said. Previously, the practice of the department had been to grant that determination after "as little a few days in boot camp," she added. The new policy aligns the requirement of honorable service with that for U.S. citizens.

2. No deportations.

DACA recipients are cleared to stay

Corey Dickstein 2018 (covers the Pentagon for Stars and Stripes; graduate of Georgia College and State University where he earned a degree in Mass Communication with a focus on journalism.) 8 February 2018 “Mattis: Dreamers in the military are protected from deportation” <https://www.stripes.com/news/mattis-dreamers-in-the-military-are-protected-from-deportation-1.510773>

Servicemembers who were brought to the United States illegally as children and are registered in the Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals, or DACA, program would be allowed to remain in the nation unless they were convicted of a “serious felony” or a federal judge had already ordered them deported, Mattis said Thursday after speaking with Homeland Security Secretary Kirstjen Nielsen about the issue. Those protections also extend to the about 1,000 DACA program enrollees – known as “Dreamers” – who have committed to military service and are awaiting orders to ship to boot camp, as well as reservists and former servicemembers who have been discharged honorably.  
**[END QUOTE. He goes on later in the article to say QUOTE:]**  
Dreamers have been allowed to serve in the military since 2009 under a program entitled Military Accessions Vital to National Interest, or MAVNI, which places immigrants with in-demand skills such as language or medical training into the military. They must past stringent background checks to enter the program.

Outliers that were still in limbo have been cleared

David Aquila 2018 (award-winning correspondent for NPR News) 15 June 2018 “ICE Drops Deportation Threat Against Chinese Student Joining U.S. Army” [second brackets added] <https://www.npr.org/2018/06/15/620150527/ice-drops-deportation-threat-against-chinese-student-joining-u-s-army>

Luo was arrested and released last week, the Department of Homeland Security told NPR, and was told by the Army to apply to a correction board — which usually takes months if not years. But after NPR and *Stars and Stripes* reported on his story, his case seemed to be resolved. The Pentagon says his enlistment status has been corrected, and ICE has confirmed it will not proceed with deportation.   
**[END QUOTE. He goes on later in the same article to say QUOTE:]**  
Luo told NPR he's very happy he can stay in the U.S. where he feels a sense of freedom. [retired Army Lt. Col. Margaret] Stock says Luo is keen to finally go to basic training — and that several other MAVNI recruits also were told recently that their cases have been corrected.

3. Technology solves for language barriers

Army has software translation tools for use in the field to solve communication issues

Ephrat Livni 2017 (writer and lawyer; wrote for the Jerusalem Report, ABC News, and FindLaw, served in the Peace Corps in Senegal.)29 January 2017 “US soldiers will be armed with machine translators to kill communication woes” <https://qz.com/887563/us-soldiers-will-be-armed-with-machine-translators-to-kill-communication-woes/>

Communication is critical in most professions, but in some, clear verbal exchanges can mean the difference between life and death. Soldiers in the US Army stationed abroad, for example, must convey and understand information in languages other than English, but don’t always have access to interpreters to help them communicate. To assist with this, the military has for years been working on a Machine Foreign Language Translation System (MFLTS), rolling out pieces of the software since 2011. The Army will “soon reach full deployment” of the platform, which runs on military and commercial devices, like laptops and phones, the [translation industry publication Slator](https://slator.com/technology/us-military-equips-soldiers-field-machine-translation/) reported in December.

4. Manpower: National Guard and Reserves are available

826K active reserves and 275K inactive reserves

**Kim Parker, Anthony Cilluffo, and Renee Stepler 2017 (Parker is director of social trends research at Pew Research Center. Cilluffo is a research assistant focusing on social and demographic trends at Pew Research Center. Stepler is a research analyst focusing on social and demographic trends at Pew Research Center.) 13 April 2017 “6 facts about the U.S. military and its changing demographics” http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/04/13/6-facts-about-the-u-s-military-and-its-changing-demographics/**

**There is much more to the U.S. military than the active-duty force.**In recent conflicts around the world, the National Guard and Reserves have often fought alongside the active-duty military. In 2015, 826,106 adults served in the Selected Reserves – those National Guard members and reservists who were available to be called to active duty. An additional 275,247 adults are in the Inactive National Guard and Individual Ready Reserve and do not engage in regular training or active-duty drills.

5. No racism

It was that terrible racist Obama in 2016 who first put the brakes on MAVNI, 2 months before Trump was elected

Jimmy Quinn 2018. (journalist) 6 July 2018 “That Story about Immigrants Being Discharged from the Military Is Much More Complex than the AP Makes It Seem” NATIONAL REVIEW <https://www.nationalreview.com/2018/07/immigrant-military-recruit-discharges-blame-bureacratic-incompetence/>

Even this limited addition to the program contributed to a modest background-check backlog. But according to Stock, the program was dealt a truly deadly blow in September 2016, when Pentagon officials ordered “extreme vetting” for MAVNI recruits. Before, these recruits had already been subjected to the background-check process for receiving top-secret security clearance, which included counterintelligence screening among other rigorous measures. Now, the additional “extreme vetting” procedures stretched the Defense Department’s capabilities to their breaking point. Stock says that this move was made without commissioning a cost-benefit analysis, and that defense officials neglected to back it with the necessary resources and manpower to carry it out. MAVNI stopped accepting new recruits shortly after the “extreme vetting” order, and the program was finally suspended in 2017.

MAVNI Shutdown: Security concerns, not racism. And Obama (2016), not Trump.

Becket Adams 2018 (journalist) WASHINGTON EXAMINER “AP's report on Army immigrant discharges looks highly misleading” 6 July 2018 <https://www.washingtonexaminer.com/opinion/aps-report-on-army-immigrant-discharges-looks-highly-misleading>

Third, there’s the fact that the [MAVNI program was effectively shut down in 2016](https://www.lexisnexis.com/legalnewsroom/immigration/b/outsidenews/archive/2017/09/14/expert-mavni-killed-by-39-bureaucratic-bumbling-39.aspx?Redirected=true) over security concerns. All new recruitment was halted, which put a select group of applicants in a curious “bureaucratic limbo,” according to [Military.com’s](https://www.military.com/daily-news/2018/04/15/recruits-bureaucratic-limbo-citizenship-program-suspended.html" \t "_blank) Richard Sisk. “The beginning of the end for MAVNI came in the form of a September 2016 memo to the service secretaries from Peter Levine, then the acting under secretary for personnel and readiness,” Sisk reported in April.

INHERENCY

1. Recruitment / Manpower being improved in Status Quo

Link: Pay gap. A reason the military is increasingly unattractive to people is because it doesn’t pay well.

*Mark Feinberg, Ph.D. 2017* (*research professor of*[*Health and Human Development at Pennsylvania State Univ*](http://hhd.psu.edu/)*; has a small business that trains military family service providers in supporting couples becoming parents.) 15 February 2017 “Trump’s growing military problem”* <http://thehill.com/blogs/pundits-blog/the-military/319651-trumps-growing-military-problems>

Active-duty troops have become increasingly unhappy: 91 percent of troops called their quality of life good or excellent in 2009, but five years later only 56 percent felt that way, according to surveys by Military Times. And intentions to re-enlist dropped from 72 percent to 63 percent. Observers believe the drop is tied to stagnant military pay. The [2014](https://www.cna.org/pop-rep/2014/summary/summary.pdf) and [2015](https://www.cna.org/pop-rep/2015/summary/summary.pdf) pay increases of 1 percent were the smallest in four decades, and last decade’s average pay increase was 4 percent, compared to 1.3 percent since 2011. Troops have noticed: Only half as many rated their pay as good or excellent in 2014 compared to 2009 (44 percent vs. 87 percent).

Impact: NDAA solves for the pay gap

Frederico Bartels and Thomas Spoehr 2018 (Frederico Bartels, Policy Analyst for defense budgeting, and Thomas Spoehr, Director, Center for National Defense - both from the Heritage Foundation) 1 June 2018 “This Is the Plan to Save America's Military” <https://www.heritage.org/defense/commentary/the-plan-save-americas-military>

Good news for those who recognize the need to rebuild our military: the House of Representatives has passed the 2019 National Defense Authorization Act (NDAA) with broad bipartisan support, 351–66. The bill continues last year’s welcome emphasis on strengthening our armed forces.  
**[END QUOTE. They go on later in the report to say QUOTE:]**  
In accordance with law and the Employment Cost Index, the bill embraces the full 2.6 percent military pay raise due in 2019. With the U.S. unemployment rate at its lowest point in seventeen years, recruiters need every cent available to help persuade today’s youth to join the military. A full pay raise aids in that effort. Still, recruiters face a daunting task. The Army reports it will lower its 2018 recruiting goal by 3,500 soldiers, due in part to difficulties attracting sufficient numbers of applicants.

SOLVENCY

1. MAVNI mismanagement

MAVNI was mismanaged and some recruits had links to foreign espionage

Tom Bowman 2017 (NPR National Desk reporter covering the Pentagon) 11 July 2017 “Citizenship For Military Service Program Under Fire” <https://www.npr.org/2017/07/11/536630223/citizenship-for-military-service-program-under-fire>

Several Defense Department officials, speaking on the condition of anonymity because they had not been authorized to discuss the program publicly, said mismanagement has been a problem.In some cases, the officials said, the military didn't use the MAVNI recruits effectively because they weren't placed in jobs in which they used their language skills. And some recruits have been investigated for suspected ties to foreign spy agencies, one official said.

Representative Steve Russell: MAVNI was suspended for good reason – too many problems

James Rosen 2017 (journalist with Fox News Channel) 1 August 2017“Pentagon investigators find ‘security risks’ in government's immigrant recruitment program, ‘infiltration’ feared” <http://www.foxnews.com/politics/2017/08/01/pentagon-investigators-find-security-risks-in-governments-immigrant-recruitment-program-infiltration-feared.html>

“The lack of discipline in implementation of this program has created problems elsewhere,” said Rep. Steve Russell, R-Okla., a retired Army officer who sits on the House Armed Services subcommittee on military personnel. It was Russell who first publicly sounded alarms. During the [markup](https://www.c-span.org/video/?430403-1/house-armed-services-committee-marks-defense-authorization-bill) of the latest defense authorization bill, on June 28, Russell noted: “The program has been replete with problems, to include foreign infiltration – so much so that the Department of Defense is seeking to suspend the program due to those concerns.”

2. No MAVNI skills benefit

MAVNI recruits aren’t high-skill: They’re cooks and other low-skill occupations

Dan Cadman 2017 (retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience; served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad) 16 November 2017 “Former U.S. Officials Spuriously Argue for a 'Dreamer' Amnesty on the Basis of National Need” <https://cis.org/Cadman/Former-US-Officials-Spuriously-Argue-Dreamer-Amnesty-Basis-National-Need>

As for other skills, a Defense Department investigation found that aliens who enlisted under the MAVNI (Military Access Vital to the National Interests) program, ostensibly because of rare and highly desirable skills, were often employed in jobs as cooks or other low-skilled occupations, and that some who were enlisted represented [significant security risks](http://www.foxnews.com/politics/2017/08/01/pentagon-investigators-find-security-risks-in-governments-immigrant-recruitment-program-infiltration-feared.html). As a result, the program was suspended.

3. Fingerprint laws

USCIS changed other rules that also reduce the military path to immigrate.

Tara Copp 2018 (Pentagon Bureau Chief for Military Times) 3 May 2018 “Naturalizations drop 65 percent for service members seeking citizenship after Mattis memo” <https://www.militarytimes.com/news/your-military/2018/05/03/naturalizations-drop-65-percent-for-service-members-seeking-citizenship-after-mattis-memo/>

However, policy changes by USCIS ― including that it may no longer be accepting DoD-provided fingerprints of applicants, despite federal law to the contrary, coupled with additional requirements before a service member can obtain an N-426 from their service leadership ― has potentially [reduced the number of service members moving through military naturalization](https://www.militarytimes.com/TEMP-LINK-TEMP/) at the agency.

Processing MAVNI applicants; Fingerprint laws remain

Tara Copp 2018 (Pentagon Bureau Chief for Military Times) 3 May 2018 “Naturalizations drop 65 percent for service members seeking citizenship after Mattis memo” <https://www.militarytimes.com/news/your-military/2018/05/03/naturalizations-drop-65-percent-for-service-members-seeking-citizenship-after-mattis-memo/>

USCIS said in a statement to Military Times that “as a result of the DOD memorandum from Oct 2017, USCIS continues to process military applications once the naturalization application and certification of honorable service have been received and all required DOD security checks have been completed.”   
[**END QUOTE. She goes on later in the article to say QUOTE**:]  
However, USCIS’ decision to no longer accept the DoD fingerprints may make it more difficult for service members to get naturalization paperwork in order. In correspondence obtained by the Military Times, USCIS said it is no longer accepting the DoD fingerprints.

DISADVANTAGES

1. Infiltration & Terrorism

Link: Look before you leap; subject people to screening *before* letting them into the military

Press Release by the Department of Defense 2017 (Written by Jim Garamone) 13 October 2017 “DoD Announces Policies Affecting Foreign Nationals Entering Military” [Brackets added] <https://www.defense.gov/News/Article/Article/1342430/dod-announces-policies-affecting-foreign-nationals-entering-military/>

The department is changing these policies because some individuals received citizenship before background investigations were completed, [DoD's director of accessions, Stephanie] Miller said. "It is in the national interest to complete the security investigation before we grant someone honorable service, particularly in the case where that characterization is considered in an application for citizenship" she added.

Link: MAVNI recruits can bypass security checks and get enlisted despite DoD safeguards

Julia Preston 2017 (She covered immigration for The New York Times for 10 years, until December 2016. She has worked as an editor and foreign correspondent for The Times and, before that, The Washington Post.) 9 September 2017 “The Double Limbo of Dreamer-Soldiers” <https://www.themarshallproject.org/2017/09/19/the-double-limbo-of-dreamer-soldiers>

Last year, the Pentagon discovered that some MAVNI recruits – none of them with DACA – had obtained student visas through a fake university set up by federal immigration investigators in a sting operation. In September 2016, the Pentagon stopped taking new recruits and issued instructions mandating a total of four rounds of security checks for MAVNI soldiers, including counterintelligence screenings usually required for high levels of clearance.

Link: Military amnesty threatens national security because absence of valid documentation opens a dangerous loophole

Federation for American Immigration Reform 2018 (a non-partisan, public interest organization of concerned Americans, united in the belief that our immigration policies and laws should again serve the nation’s future needs) April 2018 “FAIR Opposes Military Amnesty” <https://www.fairus.org/legislation/reports-and-analysis/fair-opposes-military-amnesty>

First, military amnesty threatens national security. Illegal aliens lack reliable documents that will allow the Department of Defense (DOD) to verify their identity and conduct thorough background checks, including criminal activity in the U.S. or the aliens' home countries. The inability of the military to conduct a thorough background check increases the likelihood that would-be terrorists can enlist and use their newly-received green cards to facilitate their plans to harm U.S. citizens and/or the government.

Link: Military bases are a prime target for terrorists, and joining the military is a known avenue for bad guys

Michael Cutler 2017 (retired Senior Special Agent of the former INS (Immigration and Naturalization Service) whose career spanned some 30 years. He served as an Immigration Inspector, Immigration Adjudications Officer) 3 August 2017 “U.S. MILITARY INFILTRATED BY ALIEN RECRUITS?” <https://www.frontpagemag.com/fpm/267455/us-military-infiltrated-alien-recruits-michael-cutler>

Military bases are among the most sensitive facilities to be found in the United States. Classified materials, weapons and, of course, our members of the armed forces, can all be found on every military base. Time and again, we have seen terrorists in the Middle East carry out “insider attacks” by joining the military or police and then, when the opportunity presents itself, turn their weapons on their trainers and other soldiers.

Link: Military training would aid terrorists

Michael Cutler 2017 (retired Senior Special Agent of the former INS (Immigration and Naturalization Service) whose career spanned some 30 years. He served as an Immigration Inspector, Immigration Adjudications Officer) 3 August 2017 “U.S. MILITARY INFILTRATED BY ALIEN RECRUITS?” <https://www.frontpagemag.com/fpm/267455/us-military-infiltrated-alien-recruits-michael-cutler>

Military training is highly prized and sought after by terrorists and criminals. Many terrorists travel around the world to attend terror training camps. Undoubtedly, the training our military recruits receive is a quantum leap above anything that terror training camps provide. Additionally, our soldiers learn the “playbook” employed by our military forces on the battlefield.

Link: MAVNI recruits use fake documents and are sent by foreign intelligence agencies, or even profess allegiance to America’s enemies

Tara Copp 2018. (journalist) “MAVNI troops falsified records, were security risk, DoD says” 17 July 2018 MILITARY TIMES <https://www.militarytimes.com/news/your-military/2018/07/17/mavni-troops-falsified-records-were-security-risk-dod-says/>

In addition, in his statement Smith said that through a 2016 review, DoD found that “(1) a number of individuals accessed into the military based on receiving fraudulent visas to attend universities that did not exist; (2) some MAVNI recruits attended, and later falsified transcripts from, universities owned by a Foreign National Security Agency and a State Sponsored Intelligence Organization (notably, most of the university classmates of one MAVNI recruit later worked for the same State Sponsored Intelligence Organization); and (3) one MAVNI recruit who entered the United States on a student visa professed support for 9/11 terrorists and said he would voluntarily help China in a crisis situation.”

Impact: Terrorism. Example: Kabir, Afghan US Air Force enlistee who helped Al Qaeda

Cully Stimson 2014 (Charles “Cully” Stimson is a leading expert in national security, homeland security, crime control, immigration and drug policy at The Heritage Foundation’s Center for Legal and Judicial Studies and the Center for National Defense.) 26 September 2014 “The Sneaky Way the Obama Administration Is Allowing Illegal Immigrants to Join the Military” <https://www.dailysignal.com/2014/09/26/sneaky-way-obama-administration-allowing-illegal-immigrants-join-military/>

This news comes the same week the Justice Department [convicted](http://bigstory.ap.org/article/fbi-4-calif-men-charged-alleged-terror-plot) Sohiel Kabir of terrorism. An Afghan-born, naturalized U.S. citizen who served in the U.S. Air Force, Kabir was [charged](http://www.fbi.gov/losangeles/press-releases/2012/four-men-charged-for-conspiracy-to-provide-material-support-to-terrorism) with providing material support to terrorists by making arrangements to join al-Qaeda and other related charges. He faces life in prison when sentenced.

Impact: Destruction of productive resources

Sean Ross 2016 (Sean Ross is Director of Business Development at Financial Poise™, an education and training website for investors, attorneys, accountants, and business owners/executives. He also operates an independent business consulting and writing practice. Mr. Ross earned degrees in Economics and Political Economy from Regis University, where he specialized in monetary policy and theory. Sean previously worked as a bankruptcy specialist, consultant, broker and financial advisor.) 21 August 2016 “Top 5 Ways Terrorism Impacts the Economy”<https://www.investopedia.com/articles/markets/080216/top-5-ways-terrorism-impacts-economy.asp>

The impact of terrorism and war is always negative for the economy, and physical destruction is a large reason why. Productive resources that might have generated valuable goods and services are destroyed, while other resources are almost invariably diverted from other productive uses to bolster the military and defense. None of this creates wealth or adds to the standard of living, even though military spending is often erroneously cited as a stimulant; this is the "[broken window fallacy](https://www.investopedia.com/ask/answers/08/broken-window-fallacy.asp)" sometimes mentioned by economists.

2. Military manpower

Turn AFF’s manpower harms – plan uses up manpower on more paperwork

Federation for American Immigration Reform 2018 (a non-partisan, public interest organization of concerned Americans, united in the belief that our immigration policies and laws should again serve the nation’s future needs. ) April 2018 “FAIR Opposes Military Amnesty” <https://www.fairus.org/legislation/reports-and-analysis/fair-opposes-military-amnesty>

Fourth, instead of helping the military, a military amnesty would force additional burdens onto the military and convert the DOD into a green card processing agency. In order to facilitate the issuance of green cards to every illegal alien who enlists, DOD will have to conduct a wave of background checks on illegal alien enlistees, continually send records to DHS for processing, and certify various forms of separation. Even more paperwork will be required to certify honorable service, as is required for naturalization.

3. Discrimination against legal immigrants

Heather Ham-Warren 2018 (joined FAIR’s Government Relations department in 2018. In her role, Heather advocates for FAIR’s interests before Congress, the Administration, and federal agencies) 8 May 2018 “Could There Be another Military Amnesty Push This Week? Bet on it.” <https://immigrationreform.com/2018/05/08/another-military-amnesty-push-week-bet/>

Additionally, military amnesty blatantly undermines the rule of law. This would create a fundamentally unfair situation in which one set of individuals is favored under the law. By giving automatic eligibility for citizenship to illegal aliens upon enlistment, illegal aliens are put on par with legal immigrants who respected our laws and waited patiently – often for years – to immigrate to the United States.

4. Encourages illegal immigration

Link: MAVNI promotes illegal immigration

Dan Cadman 2016 (He is a retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience. Mr. Cadman served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad. Within the immigration law enforcement field, Mr. Cadman's knowledge and experience encompass, among other things, criminal aliens, employer sanctions, and national security and terrorism matters.) 8 June 2016 “On College Admission, Military Recruitment, and Illegal Aliens” <https://cis.org/Cadman/College-Admission-Military-Recruitment-and-Illegal-Aliens>

But, as with many of this administration's policies, what you think you see isn't what you get. The MAVNI net has been cast so wide that "legal non-citizens" in fact [includes illegal aliens](http://www.nationalreview.com/corner/388917/uncle-sam-wants-illegal-aliens-us-army-mark-krikorian?utm_source=E-mail+Updates&utm_campaign=f7c6bc4b0d-Immigration_Opinions_9_28_149_28_2014&utm_medium=email&utm_term=0_7dc4c5d977-f7c6bc4b0d-45096257) who have been happy beneficiaries of the Obama administration's constitutionally dubious executive action giving them temporary amnesty, which is currently under a legal restraining order and before the Supreme Court. It also includes aliens who have received temporary protected status, another much-abused program that has been used to [shelter hundreds of thousands](http://cis.org/krikorian/temporary-protected-status-means-never-having-go-home) from the expectation that the obey the immigration laws and leave or face deportation.

Backup: Waste, fraud, and abuse always accompany any system of adjusting illegal aliens and encourages more illegal immigration

Federation for American Immigration Reform 2018 (non-partisan, public interest organization of concerned Americans, united in the belief that our immigration policies and laws should again serve the nation’s future needs.) April 2018 “FAIR Opposes Military Amnesty” <https://www.fairus.org/legislation/reports-and-analysis/fair-opposes-military-amnesty>

Second, granting amnesty (whatever the process) encourages rampant fraud and even more illegal immigration. In 1986, it was estimated that the number of illegal aliens who would receive legal status under Immigration Reform and Control Act would be one million, yet the final number of illegal alien beneficiaries was close to three million. Document fraud was rampant and the Immigration and Naturalization Service (the predecessor to USCIS) was so inundated with applications it simply rubber-stamped approvals. And, similar to the current debate on Capitol Hill, proponents of the 1986 amnesty insisted that it would solve the immigration problem once and for all. Today, however, the estimated illegal alien population has quadrupled to nearly 12 million, maybe more.

Link: Rewarding bad behavior produces more of it

Peter Nunez 2017 (former U.S. attorney in San Diego.) 29 November 2017 “Why rewarding illegal immigration is wrong” <http://www.sandiegouniontribune.com/opinion/commentary/sd-utbg-daca-illegal-immigration-20171129-story.html>

Rewarding bad behavior only assures that it will continue. Whatever relief Congress grants will encourage future illegal immigration. Parents around the world will understand that if they can get here with their minor children, they will — at some point — be granted the right to remain. Congress has granted a variety of amnesties since 1986, all of which have encouraged the highest levels of illegal immigration in history.

Impact: Crime

Dr. Steven Camarota 2018 (Director of Research for the Center for Immigration Studies (CIS), a Washington, DC-based research institute; master’s degree in political science from the University of Penn. and doctorate from Univ of Virginia in public policy analysis.) 10 January 2018 “Non-Citizens Committed a Disproportionate Share of Federal Crimes, 2011-16” <https://cis.org/Camarota/NonCitizens-Committed-Disproportionate-Share-Federal-Crimes-201116>

Many immigration advocates argue that immigrants have much lower crime rates than natives (see [this op-ed](https://www.nytimes.com/2017/01/26/us/trump-illegal-immigrants-crime.html) and [this paper](https://www.cato.org/blog/immigration-crime-what-research-says)). As my colleague Jessica Vaughan and I pointed in a [paper](https://cis.org/Report/Immigration-and-Crime) some years ago, however, the picture is far from clear. While there are [other issues](https://cis.org/Camarota/Straight-Talk-about-Immigrant-Crime), the biggest problem with studying immigrant crime is that states and localities do not systematically track the country of birth, citizenship, or legal status of those they arrest, convict, or incarcerate. But the federal government does track the citizenship of those it convicts. New data from the U.S. Sentencing Commission shows that of those convicted of federal crimes between 2011 and 2016, 44.2 percent were not U.S. citizens — 21.4 percent, if immigration crimes are excluded. In comparison, non-citizens are 8.4 percent of the adult population. Of this 8.4 percent, about 4 percent are illegal immigrants and about 4 percent are legal immigrants.

Impact: Kills jobs

Federation for American Immigration Reform 2013 (a non-partisan, public interest organization of concerned Americans, united in the belief that our immigration policies and laws should again serve the nation’s future needs. ) March 2013 “Illegal Aliens Taking U.S. Jobs” <https://www.fairus.org/issue/workforce-economy/illegal-aliens-taking-us-jobs>

If the hiring of illegal alien workers is prevalent in a sector of the economy, as it has become the case in seasonal crop agriculture, the willingness of foreign workers to accept lower wages because of their illegal status acts to depress wages and working conditions for all workers in that occupation. This in turn makes employment in that sector less attractive to U.S. workers who have other options. The result is a form of circular logic, i.e., the more that illegal aliens are able to take jobs in a sector of the economy, the less attractive the sector becomes to U.S. workers, and the greater appearance of validity to the lie that only illegal aliens are willing to take jobs in the sector. Only by enforcing the immigration law against employment of illegal alien workers can this spiral to the bottom be broken and employers forced to restore wages and working conditions to levels that will attract U.S. workers and legal foreign workers.

Works Cited: MAVNI (NEG)

1. Dan Cadman 2017 (retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience; served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad.) 4 August 2017 “MAVNI: Inappropriate Access to the Military and Needless Security Risk” https://cis.org/Cadman/MAVNI-Inappropriate-Access-Military-and-Needless-Security-Risk
2. Press Release by the Department of Defense 2017 (Written by Jim Garamone) 13 October 2017 “DoD Announces Policies Affecting Foreign Nationals Entering Military” [Brackets added] https://www.defense.gov/News/Article/Article/1342430/dod-announces-policies-affecting-foreign-nationals-entering-military/
3. Corey Dickstein 2018 (covers the Pentagon for Stars and Stripes; graduate of Georgia College and State University where he earned a degree in Mass Communication with a focus on journalism.) 8 February 2018 “Mattis: Dreamers in the military are protected from deportation” https://www.stripes.com/news/mattis-dreamers-in-the-military-are-protected-from-deportation-1.510773
4. David Aquila 2018 (award-winning correspondent for NPR News) 15 June 2018 “ICE Drops Deportation Threat Against Chinese Student Joining U.S. Army” [second brackets added] https://www.npr.org/2018/06/15/620150527/ice-drops-deportation-threat-against-chinese-student-joining-u-s-army
5. Ephrat Livni 2017 (writer and lawyer; wrote for the Jerusalem Report, ABC News, and FindLaw, served in the Peace Corps in Senegal.)29 January 2017 “US soldiers will be armed with machine translators to kill communication woes” https://qz.com/887563/us-soldiers-will-be-armed-with-machine-translators-to-kill-communication-woes/
6. Kim Parker, Anthony Cilluffo, and Renee Stepler 2017 (Parker is director of social trends research at Pew Research Center. Cilluffo is a research assistant focusing on social and demographic trends at Pew Research Center. Stepler is a research analyst focusing on social and demographic trends at Pew Research Center.) 13 April 2017 “6 facts about the U.S. military and its changing demographics” http://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/04/13/6-facts-about-the-u-s-military-and-its-changing-demographics/
7. Jimmy Quinn 2018. (journalist) 6 July 2018 “That Story about Immigrants Being Discharged from the Military Is Much More Complex than the AP Makes It Seem” NATIONAL REVIEW https://www.nationalreview.com/2018/07/immigrant-military-recruit-discharges-blame-bureacratic-incompetence/
8. Becket Adams 2018 (journalist) WASHINGTON EXAMINER “AP's report on Army immigrant discharges looks highly misleading” 6 July 2018 https://www.washingtonexaminer.com/opinion/aps-report-on-army-immigrant-discharges-looks-highly-misleading
9. Mark Feinberg, Ph.D. 2017 (research professor of Health and Human Development at Pennsylvania State Univ; has a small business that trains military family service providers in supporting couples becoming parents.) 15 February 2017 “Trump’s growing military problem” http://thehill.com/blogs/pundits-blog/the-military/319651-trumps-growing-military-problems
10. Frederico Bartels and Thomas Spoehr 2018 (Frederico Bartels, Policy Analyst for defense budgeting, and Thomas Spoehr, Director, Center for National Defense - both from the Heritage Foundation) 1 June 2018 “This Is the Plan to Save America's Military” https://www.heritage.org/defense/commentary/the-plan-save-americas-military
11. Tom Bowman 2017 (NPR National Desk reporter covering the Pentagon) 11 July 2017 “Citizenship For Military Service Program Under Fire” https://www.npr.org/2017/07/11/536630223/citizenship-for-military-service-program-under-fire
12. James Rosen 2017 (journalist with Fox News Channel) 1 August 2017“Pentagon investigators find ‘security risks’ in government's immigrant recruitment program, ‘infiltration’ feared” http://www.foxnews.com/politics/2017/08/01/pentagon-investigators-find-security-risks-in-governments-immigrant-recruitment-program-infiltration-feared.html
13. Tara Copp 2018 (Pentagon Bureau Chief for Military Times) 3 May 2018 “Naturalizations drop 65 percent for service members seeking citizenship after Mattis memo” https://www.militarytimes.com/news/your-military/2018/05/03/naturalizations-drop-65-percent-for-service-members-seeking-citizenship-after-mattis-memo/
14. Press Release by the Department of Defense 2017 (Written by Jim Garamone) 13 October 2017 “DoD Announces Policies Affecting Foreign Nationals Entering Military” [Brackets added] https://www.defense.gov/News/Article/Article/1342430/dod-announces-policies-affecting-foreign-nationals-entering-military/
15. Julia Preston 2017 (She covered immigration for The New York Times for 10 years, until December 2016. She has worked as an editor and foreign correspondent for The Times and, before that, The Washington Post.) 9 September 2017 “The Double Limbo of Dreamer-Soldiers” https://www.themarshallproject.org/2017/09/19/the-double-limbo-of-dreamer-soldiers
16. Michael Cutler 2017 (retired Senior Special Agent of the former INS (Immigration and Naturalization Service) whose career spanned some 30 years. He served as an Immigration Inspector, Immigration Adjudications Officer) 3 August 2017 “U.S. MILITARY INFILTRATED BY ALIEN RECRUITS?” https://www.frontpagemag.com/fpm/267455/us-military-infiltrated-alien-recruits-michael-cutler
17. Cully Stimson 2014 (Charles “Cully” Stimson is a leading expert in national security, homeland security, crime control, immigration and drug policy at The Heritage Foundation’s Center for Legal and Judicial Studies and the Center for National Defense.) 26 September 2014 “The Sneaky Way the Obama Administration Is Allowing Illegal Immigrants to Join the Military” https://www.dailysignal.com/2014/09/26/sneaky-way-obama-administration-allowing-illegal-immigrants-join-military/
18. Sean Ross 2016 (Sean Ross is Director of Business Development at Financial Poise™, an education and training website for investors, attorneys, accountants, and business owners/executives. He also operates an independent business consulting and writing practice. Mr. Ross earned degrees in Economics and Political Economy from Regis University, where he specialized in monetary policy and theory. Sean previously worked as a bankruptcy specialist, consultant, broker and financial advisor.) 21 August 2016 “Top 5 Ways Terrorism Impacts the Economy”https://www.investopedia.com/articles/markets/080216/top-5-ways-terrorism-impacts-economy.asp
19. Heather Ham-Warren 2018 (joined FAIR’s Government Relations department in 2018. In her role, Heather advocates for FAIR’s interests before Congress, the Administration, and federal agencies) 8 May 2018 “Could There Be another Military Amnesty Push This Week? Bet on it.” https://immigrationreform.com/2018/05/08/another-military-amnesty-push-week-bet/
20. Dan Cadman 2016 (He is a retired INS / ICE official with thirty years of government experience. Mr. Cadman served as a senior supervisor and manager at headquarters, as well as at field offices both domestically and abroad. Within the immigration law enforcement field, Mr. Cadman's knowledge and experience encompass, among other things, criminal aliens, employer sanctions, and national security and terrorism matters.) 8 June 2016 “On College Admission, Military Recruitment, and Illegal Aliens” https://cis.org/Cadman/College-Admission-Military-Recruitment-and-Illegal-Aliens
21. Federation for American Immigration Reform 2018 (non-partisan, public interest organization of concerned Americans, united in the belief that our immigration policies and laws should again serve the nation’s future needs.) April 2018 “FAIR Opposes Military Amnesty” https://www.fairus.org/legislation/reports-and-analysis/fair-opposes-military-amnesty
22. Peter Nunez 2017 (former U.S. attorney in San Diego.) 29 November 2017 “Why rewarding illegal immigration is wrong” http://www.sandiegouniontribune.com/opinion/commentary/sd-utbg-daca-illegal-immigration-20171129-story.html
23. Dr. Steven Camarota 2018 (Director of Research for the Center for Immigration Studies (CIS), a Washington, DC-based research institute; master’s degree in political science from the University of Penn. and doctorate from Univ of Virginia in public policy analysis.) 10 January 2018 “Non-Citizens Committed a Disproportionate Share of Federal Crimes, 2011-16” https://cis.org/Camarota/NonCitizens-Committed-Disproportionate-Share-Federal-Crimes-201116
24. Federation for American Immigration Reform 2013 (a non-partisan, public interest organization of concerned Americans, united in the belief that our immigration policies and laws should again serve the nation’s future needs. ) March 2013 “Illegal Aliens Taking U.S. Jobs” https://www.fairus.org/issue/workforce-economy/illegal-aliens-taking-us-jobs